

**ALPINE TOWNSHIP PLANNING COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
Thursday, April 16, 2015**

**15-17 CALL TO ORDER / APPROVAL OF THE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES OF
MARCH 12, 2015 REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF March 19, 2015 AND
THE / PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS**

The Alpine Township Planning Commission held its regular meeting on April 16, 2015, at 7:30 p.m. at the Alpine Township Center, 5255 Alpine Ave., NW, Comstock Park, MI 49321. Present: Chair Bruce Lee, Vice Chair Mike O'Malley, Secretary Lisa Frizzell, Ron Cordes, Dawn Swafford, Chuck Jakems and Mike Kayner. Planner Susan Becker, Recording Secretary Rose Kogge and Township Engineer Mike Oezer were also present. Chair Bruce Lee called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m. with the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Jakems moved, with support from Cordes to approve the minutes of the Special Planning Commission Meeting of the Alpine Planning Commission on March 12, 2015

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

O'Malley moved, with support from Cordes to approve the minutes of the Regular Meeting of the Alpine Planning Commission on March 19, 2015.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

No public comment on non-agenda items

**15-18 PRESENTATION: TOWNSHIP CENTER STORM WATER AND SIDEWALK
IMPROVEMENTS**

Township Engineer Mike Oezer (Progressive AE) gave a presentation on the planned storm water and sidewalk improvements at the Township Center Property (5255 Alpine Ave NW). He reviewed the storm water and sidewalk compliance work, MDOT's work with the storm water at the corner of 6 Mile Rd. and Alpine Ave., and stated the sidewalk will be completed right up to the front door of the Township. Oezer said they hope to have the bids out by May 20, bids returned by June 10 and award the bid at the June Township meeting. The goal is to have this project work completed by the second week in September.

The Planning Commission members questioned whether there should be a storm water management agreement with ourselves (the Township) and it was agreed there should be one. Cordes asked if any of this work will affect the wetlands. Oezer said it would not. The subject of a fence by the culvert was discussed and agreed it was not needed. Oezer said the current retaining wall will be replaced with a block wall. Becker commented if there are any funds left from this project maybe they could be used to refresh the Township landscaping, as it is 20 years old. Landscaping is not part of the proposed contract.

15-19 PUBLIC HEARING: REZONING REQUEST BY CHARLES MORGAN TO REZONE 942 & 960 ALPINE CHURCH ST FROM R-1, LOW DENSITY TO R-3 HIGH DENSITY RESIDENTIAL

Planner Becker reviewed the staff report with the Planning Commission members and audience. Property owner Charles Morgan has requested the properties at 942 and 960 Alpine Church Street be rezoned from R-1 Low Density Residential to R-3 High Density Residential. Becker discussed the properties surrounding the applicant's properties, the subject property's conformance to the 2007 Alpine Township Master Plan recommendation of High Density Residential and relevant zoning ordinance information.

Charles Morgan, 6750 Brookwood Dr., Grandville, MI gave a brief description of his apartment plans for these two lots. Morgan said Feenstra & Associates are working on an official site plan. He said he had built the Timber Ridge apartments in Wyoming and wanted to construct a building(s) in a similar manner with an entrance on the middle level and then going up or down for the additional floors. Morgan said there would be a total of 12 units, eight two-bedroom and four three bedroom apartments. Morgan commented that a property owner next to this property asked if he wanted to buy her property as well. He stated he doesn't personally manage his apartments anymore because he is older now.

Cordes motioned, supported by Kayner to open the Public Hearing.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

Chad Fessenden of 920 Alpine Church Street, said he has lived here for seven years and loves the house and property. He said they have the best of both worlds with the rural aspect, yet close to Alpine Avenue. He feels building these 12 units would increase traffic on Alpine Church Street and he is not in favor of it.

Chris Alt, 1012 Alpine Church Street, lives four houses to the west. I oppose this, we don't need the added traffic, especially with church traffic. It is very difficult to turn left (northbound) onto Alpine Avenue. The hill is a safety issue.

Eileen Maycroft of 320 Timber Creek, previously lived at 1020 Alpine Church Street, my daughter lives there now. Alpine Church Street is a busy narrow street without sidewalks. This should be kept low density residential. Traffic has increased with two schools and the church on the street. It is too difficult to back out of the driveway now. There are already many apartments off of Alpine Avenue with direct easy access.

Fred Alt, owner of Churchill Place Apartments, 4601 Alpine Ave. Stated his apartments back up to the property proposed for apartments. He is concerned there will be parking problems because Morgan will not have enough spaces especially if he has three bedroom apartments. Alt's apartments have 24-hour, on-call staff along with on-site management and wonders if Morgan will do the same. He said if he does not have on-site management it could potentially cause problems.

Lee Roersma, 890 Alpine Church Street, said her property is in a transition zone, she would love to sell but someone would have to have cash because her house is in a non-conforming area (zoned commercial). This proposed apartment is not fair for the people who live on either side of it. Purchase their land first for a larger lot.

Motion by Cordes, supported by O'Malley to close the Public Hearing.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

Morgan stated the reason he applied for rezoning is because it is Master Planned for High Density Residential. If there is a better alternative, I don't know what it is. I don't want to get the neighbors upset. If you don't want apartments there you should change the Master Plan. You leave yourself open to controversy by leaving it that way.

Chair Lee confirmed the properties are zoned R-1, Low Density Residential and are Master Planned for High Density Residential.

Planning Commissioners discussed how small the lot size of peoples lots were next to the residential properties Mr. Morgan owns. Chair Lee commented he did not realize how small the neighboring lots next to the proposed site were. Although it is Master Planned HDR, it does not make sense to have apartments so close to residents as a traffic issue. Chair Lee said he understands where Morgan is coming from, however we are dooming the resident's on either side of Mr. Morgan's property. No one would want to buy their lots if apartments were there. O'Malley said we are on a slippery slope here. We are listening to people and they keep saying they do not want any more rentals here.

MOTION FOR REZONING PROPERTY ADDRESSED 942 & 960 ALPINE CHURCH ST
--

O'Malley motioned, supported by Jakems to recommend to the Alpine Township Board to *deny* the requested rezoning for the properties addressed 942 and 960 Alpine Church Street (PP# 41-09-26-426-011 and -012) as publicly noticed from R-1, Low Density Residential to R-3, High Density Residential.

Findings of Fact:

Based upon representations made by the applicant during rezoning review and upon the standards found in Chapter 9 and 24 of the Alpine Township Zoning Ordinance and the 2007 Alpine Township Master Plan, we find that the proposed rezoning:

- 1) Is *not* consistent with the High Density Residential future land use recommendation of the 2007 Alpine Township Master Plan.
- 2) The location *is not* appropriate for all the allowed uses in the R-3, High Density Residential zoning district.
- 3) *Does not* ensure compatibility with adjoining land uses and zoning types.
- 4) *Is not* compatible with the existing character in Alpine Township;
- 5) *Would* severely impact traffic, municipal costs and services, or significantly change population density.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

Recommend denial of rezoning to the Township Board.

15- 20 PUBLIC HEARING: SPECIAL LAND USE AND SITE PLAN REQUEST FROM DOUG WING OF ALPINE PENNZOIL TO ALLOW FOR A VEHICLE REPAIR BUSINESS AND BUILDING ADDITION AT 4586 ALPINE AVE WITHIN THE C-2, GENERAL ZONING DISTRICT

Planner Becker noted that she had received a letter from property neighbor Judith McNally of 4555 Alpine Avenue. Ms. McNally is not in favor of the request. She is concerned about the number of cars that would be parked there long term. Becker commented that another woman brought in the printed legal notice from the Grand Rapids Press and wrote "yes" across it. Becker reviewed the Staff Report for this request with the Planning Commission members. She covered the 1988 rear setback variance and stated the Township will install the sidewalk with grant monies this summer but that Mr. Wing will be responsible to maintain it. She then turned the review over to Township Engineer Mike Oezer who stated the storm water improvements are not in full compliance with the Township's ordinance but they are improving the situation and have worked with the available land. We asked that they build a basin with stone and pipe in the northeast corner, regrade the front of the parking lot so the runoff will go into the front grass before it goes into a catch basin at Lake Michigan Credit Union to the south. This is an underserved area for storm water management as a lot of water goes directly into York Creek. He will also pay the York Creek drainage district fee.

Mr. Doug Wing, 4568 Alpine Avenue and the owner of Alpine Pennzoil stated the roof water of the building addition will travel underground to the rear basin and I will tear up the front lawn to provide storm water storage to slow down the flow into York Creek and to Lake Michigan Credit Union to the south.

Wing commented that the building will look very nice when completed. The customer cars will be parked in eight spots behind the building addition and will not be visible from Alpine Avenue. As far as the front parking lot, we now have offsite storage for the snowplows and sole a project car so that frees up some parking spaces. We greet our customers at the door so doors are not blocked.

As far as auto repair shops in this area go, there was an auto repair shop across the street that was demolished last year and there were auto repair shops in this area previously.

Cordes asked if sidewalks will have ADA ramps across the driveways. There will be ramps per Wing. O'Malley asked how you could see to turn left out of the oil change bays, looks like you will lose a couple of parking spots. Wing answered he owns both driveways and could put signage up; he said his customers come in from the front – not the back.

Lee asked how many parking spots there were. Wing answered 17 including 8 behind the building for those waiting for repairs. Lee asked what if 20 cars came in? Wing replied they have three bays for repairs, two bays for 15 minute repairs, and will purchase an alignment machine because that is the number one repair in Michigan. They pride themselves in the quality and speed of their repairs and repairs will normally take one day. Wing also stated he will build a screened dumpster pad, a 12 x 12 out building, used tires will be kept in the shed, and new tires will be kept inside. Wing also commented that the roof is red and they would like to keep those colors to be noticed from the road. When asked about HVAC equipment, Wing stated they heat the building using waste oil and no air conditioning is needed. He said they will fix the broken light pole as requested.

Kayner motioned, supported by O'Malley to open the Public Hearing.
Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

Kayner motioned, supported by O'Malley to close the Public Hearing.
Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion Carried

<p align="center">MOTION FOR ALPINE PENNZOIL AND VEHICLE REPAIR SPECIAL LAND USE FOR AT 4586 ALPINE AVENUE</p>

Based upon representations made by the applicant, Kayner motioned, supported by Cordes to *approve* the Special Land Use permit requested for vehicle repair business at 4586 Alpine Avenue, PP# 41-09-25-351-017 as it *does* meet the standards set forth in Chapter 21 of the Alpine Township Zoning Ordinance.

Findings of Fact:

1. It will be harmonious with the character and use of the immediate vicinity and was designed in such a manner as to mitigate any negative effects.
2. The special use will not be detrimental to any persons, property, or the general welfare by reason of excessive production of traffic, noise, smoke, fumes, glare, or odors.
3. The proposed use is consistent with Master Plan and the intent and purpose of the C-2 zoning district.
4. The proposed use will not set a precedent for development which could adversely affect the long term plans and policies of the Township since vehicle repairs is a special land use in the commercial district

Conditions:

1. Removed vehicle parts and tires shall be stored in a building prior to proper disposal.
2. Eight vehicles awaiting repair shall be held behind (east of) the proposed building addition with a maximum of eight vehicles.
3. This special land use does not include vehicle dismantling to salvage parts for use or sale.
4. The proposed red roof color for the building addition is acceptable as it matches the existing red roof color of the Pennzoil oil change building.
5. Outdoor parking/storage of vehicles shall not exceed one week.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion carried

<p align="center">Alpine Pennzoil Site Plan at 4586 Alpine Avenue</p>
--

Based upon representations made by the applicant, Kayner motioned, supported by Cordes to *approve* the site plan dated March 31, 2015 drawn by More & Bruggink and building elevation drawings dated February 19, 2015 drawn by Tailored Building Systems for the construction of a

1,728-sq. ft. addition on the 1.13-acre property addressed 4586 Alpine Ave., PP# 41-09-25-351-017 as it *does* meet the requirements set forth in Chapters 12, 18 and 19 of the Alpine Township Zoning Ordinance with the following conditions of approval:

Conditions of Approval:

1. The applicant shall supply to the Township 4 copies of a revised site plan illustrating:
 - The dimensions of the dumpster enclosure and the dimensions of the shed on the on the proposed concrete pad.
 - The changes required by the Township Engineer
2. All new light fixtures must be full-cut off fixtures compliant with the Zoning Ordinance's requirements.
3. All conditions outlined in the Township Engineer's letter dated March 31, 2015.
4. The applicant shall enter into a site development agreement with the Township that memorializes the aforementioned items and approvals.

Ayes: 7 Nays: 0 Motion carried

**15-21 SITE PLAN REVIEW: KELTING INVESTMENT PROPERTIES LLC
REQUESTS SITE PLAN APPROVAL TO ALLOW FOR THE
CONSTRUCTION OF TWO RETAIL BUILDINGS (9,600 SQ FT AND
20140 SQ FT) AT 1019 4 MILE ROAD WITHIN THE C-2, COMMERCIAL
ZONING DISTRICT**

Planner Becker reviewed the staff report for Planning Commission members; the site and surroundings, property history, site plan analysis, grading and storm water, vehicular access and circulation; parking and landscaping. Township Engineer Mike Oezer reviewed his letter dated April 2nd, regarding this site plan. He commented that the applicant is planning to connect to water and sewer and this would have to be coordinated with the respective utility operators.

Engineer Oezer said this site is located in the district of the regional storm water pond known as the Alfour Pond. The pond was sized to accommodate the runoff from this site in a developed condition. The Kent County Drain Commissioner is requesting storm water calculations for the proposed site for their use in evaluating if the pond has capacity. The applicant is proposing construction of new storm water collection pipes within the development to drain the parking lots and handle runoff. The layout and sizing of that system appears to be adequate. A Storm Water Permit will be required and the additions to the storm system. All criteria in the Engineer's letter dated April 2nd, 2015 must be completed.

The Planning Commissioners discussed the site plan. They commented that the truck turning movements are very tight. It was asked who maintains the road and how many owners of the road are there. Dan Hula commented that just off 4 Mile Road the PUD road is owned by Paul Land who granted an easement which was conceived before the buildings were even built back there. Planning Commission members wondered if a new road should be constructed

without easements through the condominium property.

Property owner Scott Kelting, of Kelting Investment Properties LLC, PO Box 120, Comstock Park, MI, commented he has had little conversation with the condominium owners regarding the road. Kelting is in the business of refurbishing apartment units.

Dan Hula, Hula Engineering 17 West Oak Street, Sand Lake, MI. Hula referred to his letter dated February 28, 2015 to Dean Rosendall explaining the complicated access easement situation. Planner Becker commented that cross access will need to be sorted out before any building permits are issued.

Rob Constantine of Copperrock Construction, 608 6th St., Grand Rapids MI commented on the quality of the components for the building, façade and colors (muted blue and gray) for the building. Constantine said they would use fire grade walling and not sprinkle the building. The hazardous material (latex paint) will be stored in a fire cabinet. The property owner will use both halves of the southern building.

Frizzell asked if the Fire Chief has looked at the fire hydrant at this location. Constantine said he had.

Constantine said the HVAC equipment will be located inside the building. Storm water will run into catch basin #3 from a 24- inch curb gutter then into the drain.

MOTION FOR SITE PLAN FOR TWO COMMERCIAL BUILDINGS AT 1019 4 MILE ROAD

Based upon representations made by the applicant, Jakems motioned, supported by Kayner to *approve* the site plan dated March 30, 2015 drawn by Hula Engineering for two commercial buildings on a 4-acre parcel at 1019 4 Mile Road (PP# 41-09-35-452-021) as the request *does* meet the requirements set forth in Chapters 12, 18 and 19 of the Alpine Township Zoning Ordinance with the following conditions of approval:

Condition of Approval:

1. The applicant shall provide 4 copies of revised plans illustrating:
 - 4-sided dumpster enclosure information
 - Location and screening if necessary of HVAC equipment
 - Items requested by the Township Engineer
 - Label what type of ground cover to be used on the slope between the south lot line and the building
 - The parking lot immediately east of the southern building should be shaded (i.e. construction concurrent with proposed buildings) on the Sheet 1 of the site plan.
 - Clarify that the concrete masonry units are located on the north and east elevations of the south building
 - Truck turning plan for the loading space
 - Access road widened to 24 feet
 - Proposed building materials shall be as demonstrated

2. A 66-foot wide access easement and maintenance agreement shall be established through the site to benefit the condominium. An emergency access easement shall also be established.
3. The access road shall be widened to 24-feet and the road's surface repaired.
4. An emergency access gate, in an acceptable form to the Fire Chief, shall be installed.
5. A photometric plan and fixture cut sheets shall be provided for staff review and approval.
6. All conditions outlined in the Township Engineer's letter dated April 2, 2015.
7. The applicant shall enter into a site development agreement with the Township to memorialize the approvals given.

Ayes 7 Nays: 0 Motion carried

15-22 DISCUSSION: ANY MASTER PLAN ISSUES THAT NEED ADDRESSING

O'Malley asked if we should clean up the Alpine Church Street properties. Where is the property zoned for high density property located in this area? Planner Becker answered behind the Filling Station restaurant on Alpine Avenue.

Can we recommend that high-density be removed from the Master Plan?

Susan Krieger, 974 Alpine NW, commented she lived to the west of the proposed Morgan Apartment site. She said her property would be worthless. She said she is the person Morgan approached to sell.

O'Malley asked if this area can be Master Planned Low Density Residential instead. Does this compromise our timeline on the Master Plan?

Planning Commissioners voted on changing this area along Alpine Church Street to Low Density Residential.

Kayner – yes, Cordes – yes, Frizzell - yes, Swafford – no, Jakems- no, O'Malley – yes, Lee - no
Ayes: 4 Nays: 3 Motion carried to move forward to formally consider changing the Master Plan to LDR. Property owners will be invited to the next Planning Commission Meeting to share their thoughts.

15-23 ADJOURNMENT

Frizzell motioned, supported by Cordes to adjourn the meeting at 10:41 PM
Ayes:7 Nays:0 Motion carried.

Lisa Frizzell, Planning Commission Secretary Rose Kogge, Recording Secretary